The data-richness spectrum and sustainability of California fisheries

Louis W. Botsford

D. Patrick Kilduff

Department of Wildlife, Fish and Conservation Biology University of California Davis, CA 95616

Workshop: Managing Data-Poor Fisheries: Case Studies, Models, and Solutions December 2008

Definition: Spectrum of data-richness

The distribution of <u>combinations</u> of data types available for each fishery

Why?

1. Overall level of certainty re: population health, risk....

2. Program for reduction in level of uncertainty.

3. Assessment at higher level than single population (ecosystem?)

Procedure:

1. Make a list of data combinations for each fishery (Table 1)

2. Analyze data combinations based on:a. Precautionary Approachb. Population Dynamics

$ \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	Category	Species /Group	Landings	Effort	Size Age Composition Composition		Stock Assessed	Life History
Spiny LobserC-1916C-1923XXRed Sea UrchinC-1970C-1983XXPurple Sea UrchinC-1976XXXDungeness CrabC-1916XXXBrown and Red)C-1926XXXBrown and Red)C-1926XXXBrown and Red)C-1928XXXSpot PrawnC-1928XXXRed Rock ShrimpC-1993XXXRed Rock ShrimpC-1993XXXCoonstripe ShrimpC-1993XXXSea ClucumbersC-1976C-1986XXViang ClupesC-1997XXXSea ClucumbersC-1998XXXWavy Turban SnailC-1992XXXSpeciesSquidC-1916C-1981XXSpeciesSquidC-1916C-1981XXNorthern AnchoryC-1916C-1981XXXNorthern AnchoryC-1916C-1985XXXSpeciesSwordishC-1916C-1983XXXNorthern AnchoryC-1916C-1926XXXXSpeciesSwordishC-1916C-1926XXXXSpeciesSwordishC-1916C-1925XXXXSpeciesSwordishC-1916C-1926 <t< td=""><td>Nearshore Invertebrates</td><td>Abalone</td><td>C-1916</td><td>R-1975</td><td>R-1975</td><td></td><td></td><td>Х</td></t<>	Nearshore Invertebrates	Abalone	C-1916	R-1975	R-1975			Х
Red Sea Urchin C-1970 C-1988 X X Purple Sea Urchin C-1923 X X Brown and Red) C-1926 X X Brown and Red) C-1926 X X Brown and Red) C-1978 X X Ocean Shrinp C-1978 X X Brown and Red) C-1978 X X Ocean Shrinp C-1978 X X Red Reck Shrinp C-1973 C-1986 X Coastaf Reck Shrinp C-1978 X X Sea Cucumbers C-1978 X X Vary Turban Snail C-1978 X X Rock Scatop R-1978 X X Rock Scatop R-1978 X X Rock Scatop C-1976 X X Pacific Sardine C-1976 X X Rock Scatop C-1976 X X X Rock Scatop C-1976 X X X Rock Scatop C-1976 X X <td></td> <td>Spiny Lobster</td> <td>C-1916</td> <td>C-1973</td> <td>X</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>X</td>		Spiny Lobster	C-1916	C-1973	X			X
Purple Sea UrchinC-1983XXDungeness CrabC-1916XXXRock Crabs (YellowC-1926XXBrown and Red)C-1978XXSheep CrabsC-1978XXCons ShrimpC-1973C-1986XSpot PrawnC-1973C-1986XSpot PrawnC-1973C-1986XConstripe ShrimpC-1994XXConstripe ShrimpC-1997XXSea CucumbersC-1978C-1993XSand CrabC-1978C-1993XSand CrabC-1978XXSund CrabC-1978XXSund CrabC-1978XXSund CrabC-1978XXSund CrabC-1978XXSund CrabC-1978XXSund CrabC-1979XXKetler's WhileC-1979XXSund CrabC-1975XXSund CrabC-1976XXSund Crab <t< td=""><td></td><td>Red Sea Urchin</td><td>C-1970</td><td>C-1988</td><td>Х</td><td></td><td></td><td>X</td></t<>		Red Sea Urchin	C-1970	C-1988	Х			X
Imponents Carlo C.1916 X X X Brown and Red C.1926 X X Brown and Red C.1926 X X Sheep Crab C.1926 X X Ocean Shrimp C.1928 X X Ridgeback Prawn C.1973 C.1986 X Red Rock Shrimp C.1973 C.1984 X Cocean Shrimp C.1978 C.1993 X Sac Cucumbers C.1978 C.1993 X Sand Crab C.1978 C.1993 X Sand Crab C.1978 X X Sand Crab C.1978 X X Sand Crab C.1978 X X Now Limpet C.1978 X X Sand Crab C.1978 X X Sand Crab C.1976 X X Not kimpet C.1976 X X Sand Crab C.1976 X X X </td <td></td> <td>Purple Sea Urchin</td> <td>C-1983</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>X</td>		Purple Sea Urchin	C-1983					X
Bangeness Octob C-1916 A A A A Rock Crabs (Yellow, Brown and Red) C-1926 X X Sheep Crab C-1978 X X Ocean Shrimp C-1950 X X Spot Pravan C-1928 X X Red Rock Shrimp C-1994 X X Red Rock Shrimp C-1994 X X Constripe Shrimp C-1994 X X Constripe Shrimp C-1994 X X Sea Cucumbers C-1993 X X Vary Turban Snatt C-1993 X X Wavy Turban Snatt C-1978 X X Owit Limpet C-1980s X X X Species Squid C-1916 C-1981 X X Pacific Sardine C-1916 C-1983 X X X Northern Anchovy C-1916 C-1983 X X X Species Swordfish C-1916 C-1983 X X X		Dunganass Crab	C_{-1916}	X	Y			X
Sheep Crab C.1978 X Ocean Shrimp C-1920 X Spot Prawn C-1928 X Spot Prawn C-1923 X Red Rock Shrimp C-1924 X X Coonstripe Shrimp C-1994 X X Coonstripe Shrimp C-1978 X X Sea Cucumbers C-1978 X X Sand Crab C-1978 X X Wavy Turban Snail C-1903 X X Owl Limpet C-1980s X X Owl Limpet C-1916 C-1981 X X Species Squid C-1916 C-1981 X X Northern Anchovy C-1916 C-1981 X X X Highly Pacific Mackerel C-1916 C-1983 X X X Northern Anchovy C-1916 C-1983 X X X X Pacific Northern C-1916 C-1983 R-1983 X X X Pacific Northern <td< td=""><td></td><td>Rock Crabs (Yellow , Brown and Red)</td><td>C-1926</td><td>Л</td><td>А</td><td></td><td></td><td>X</td></td<>		Rock Crabs (Yellow , Brown and Red)	C-1926	Л	А			X
Ocean Shrimp C-1950 X X Spot Prawn C-1923 C-1980 X Ridgeback Prawn C-1973 C-198 X Ridgeback Prawn C-1973 C-198 X Red Rock Shrimp C-1999 X X Coonstripe Shrimp C-1976 C-1993 X Sea Cucumbers C-1961 X X Sand Crab C-1963 X X Wavy Turban Snail C-1992 X X Rock Scallop R-1978 X X X Northern Anchony C-1960 X X X X Species California Market C-1975 X X X X Species Saudi C-1916 C-1981 X X X X Highly Migratory Species Albacerel C-1916 C-1983 X X X X Specific Markerel C-1916 R-1983 R-1983 X X X X Specific Sardine C-1916 R-1983 <td></td> <td>Sheep Crab</td> <td>C-1978</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>X</td>		Sheep Crab	C-1978					X
		Ocean Shrimp	C - 1950	X				X
		Spot Prawn	C_{-1928}					
Ridgeback Prior C-19/3 C-1930 A Rack Shrimp C-1999 X X Coonstripe Shrimp C-1999 X X Sea Cucumbers C-1978 C-1993 X Pismo Clam C-1916 to 1947 X X Sea Cucumbers C-1963 X X Sund Crab C-1963 X X Wavy Turban Snail C-1992 X X Owl Limpet C-1980s X X X Goastal Pelagic California Market C-1916 C-1981 X X Species Siguid C-1916 C-1985 X X X Migratory C-1916 C-1985 X X X X Northern Anchoxy C-1916 C-1983 X X X X Migratory Albacore C-1916 C-1983 X X X X Skipjact Tuna C-1916 C-1975 C-1975 X X X X Migratory Skipjack Tuna		Dida ah wah Dermour	C-1072	C 1096				V
Red Rock Shrimp C-1994 X X Coonstripe Shrimp C-1994 X X Sea Cucumbers C-1978 C-1993 X Fismo Clam C-1916 to 1947 X X Sand Crab C-1992 X X Wavy Turban Snail C-1992 X X Owl Limpet C-1980s X X Owl Limpet C-1916 C-1981 X Species Squid C-1916 C-1981 X Pacific Sardine C-1916 C-1985 X X X Pacific Sardine C-1916 C-1985 X X X X Pacific Nacherel C-1924 R-1935 X X X X Migratory Albacore C-1916 C-1966 R-1983 X X X Species Swordfish C-1916 C-1975 C-1975 X X X Highly Albacore C-1916 R-1983 X X X Shyripack Tuna C-1916		Riageback Prawn	C-1973	C-1980				
		Red Rock Shrimp	C-1994	X				X
Sea Cutumbers C-1978 C-1993 Pismo Clam C-1916 to 1947 X Sand Crab C-1916 to 1947 X Sand Crab C-1963 X Wavy Turban Snail C-1992 X Rock Scallop R-1978 X Owl Limpet C-1980s X X California Market C-1916 C-1981 X Species Squid C-1916 C-1983 X X Pacific Sardine C-1916 C-1985 X X X Pacific Sardine C-1916 C-1985 X X X X Pacific Mackerel C-1924 R-1985 X X X X Migratory Albacore C-1916 C-1983 X X X X Migratory Swordfish C-1916 C-1983 X X X X Migratory Swordfish C-1916 C-1975 C-1975 X X X Migratory Swordfish C-1916 R-1983 R-1983		Coonstripe Shrimp	C-1999					X
Pismo Clam C-1916 to 1947 X Sand Crab C-1963 X Wavy Turban Snail C-1992 X Rock Scallop R-1978 X Owl Limpet C-1980s X X Owl Limpet C-1980s X X Species Squid C-1916 C-1981 X X Pacific Sardine C-1916 C-1981 X X X Pacific Sardine C-1916 C-1981 X X X Pacific Sardine C-1916 R-1983 X X X X Pacific Mackerel C-1924 R-1983 X X X X X Migratory Albacore C-1916 R-1983 R-1983 X X X X X Species Swordfish C-1916 C-1975 C-1975 X		Sea Cucumbers	C-1978	C-1993				
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $		Pismo Clam	C-1916 to 1947					X
Wavy Turban Snail C-1992 X Rock Scallop R-1978 X Owl Limpet C-1980s X X Coastal Pelagic California Market C-1979 X Species California Market C-1916 C-1981 X Northern Anchovy C-1916 C-1981 X X Pacific Sardine C-1916 C-1985 X X X Pacific Mackerel C-1924 R-1935 X X X Pacific Mackerel C-1924 R-1935 X X X Migratory Albacore C-1916 X X X X Species Swordfish C-1916 C-1983 R X X X Migratory Albacore C-1916 C-1966 R-1983 X X X Skipjack Tuna C-1916 C-1975 C-1975 X X X Skipjack Tuna C-1916 C-1975 C-1975 X X X Skipjack Tuna C-1977 X		Sand Crab	C-1963					X
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $		Wavy Turban Snail	C-1992					X
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $		Rock Scallop	R-1978					
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $		Owl Limpet	C-1980s		X			X
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $		Kellet's Whelk	C-1979					X
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	Coastal Pelagic Species	California Market Squid	C-1916	C-1981				X
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $		Pacific Sardine	C-1916	C-1985	X	X	X	X
Pacific MackerelC-1924R-1935XXXJack MackerelC-1924XXHighly Migratory SpeciesAlbacoreC-1916C-1966R-1983XXXSwordfishC-1916XXXXXPacific Northern Bluefin TunaC-1916R-1983R-1983XXXSkipjack TunaC-1916C-1975C-1975XXXSkipjack TunaC-1916C-1975C-1975XXXStriped MarilinR-1947C-1950sXXXShortfin Mako SharkC-1977XXXXBlue SharksC-1977XXXXGreat White SharkC-1977XXXXGreat White SharkC-1977XXXXOpahC-1976XXXXDolnhinR-1983R-1983R-1983Y		Northern Anchovy	C-1916	D 1025		X	V	X
Highly Migratory Species Albacore C-1916 C-1966 R-1983 X X X Species Swordfish C-1916 X<		Jack Mackerel	C-1924 C-1924	<i>K-1933</i>		Λ	Λ	X X
Migratory Species Albacore C-1916 C-1966 R-1983 X X X X Swordfish C-1916 X	Highly		0 1/2/					**
Swordfish C-1916 X	Migratory Species	Albacore	C-1916	C-1966	R-1983	X	X	X
Pacific Northern Bluefin Tuna C-1916 R-1983 R-1983 X X Skipjack Tuna C-1916 C-1975 C-1975 X X Yellowfin Tuna C-1916 C-1975 C-1975 X X X Striped Marilin R-1947 C-1975 C-1975 X X X Shortfin Mako Shark C-1977 C-1950s X X X X Shortfin Mako Shark C-1977 X X X X Blue Shark C-1977 X X X X Great White Shark C-1977 X X X Basking Shark C-1979 X X X Opah C-1977 X X X Basking Shark C-1979 X X X Mono Shark C-1976 X X X Opah C-1976 X X X Dolphin R-1983 R-1983		Swordfish	C-1916	X	X	X	X	X
Skipjack Tuna C-1916 C-1975 C-1975 X X Yellowfin Tuna C-1916 C-1975 C-1975 X X X Striped Marilin R-1947 C-1950s X X X X Shortfin Mako Shark C-1977 X X X X Shortfin Mako Shark C-1977 X X X Thresher Sharks C-1977 X X X Blue Shark C-1977 X X X Great White Shark C-1977 X X X Basking Shark C-1979 X X X Great White Shark C-1979 X X X Salmon Shark C-1977 X X X Opah C-1976 X X X Louvar C-1984 X X X Dolnhin R-1973 R-1983 R-1983 Y		Pacific Northern Bluefin Tuna	C-1916	R-1983	R-1983		X	X
Yellowfin Tuna C-1916 C-1975 C-1975 X X X Striped Marilin R-1947 C-1950s X X X Shortfin Mako Shark C-1977 X X X Shortfin Mako Shark C-1977 X X X Thresher Sharks C-1977 X X X Blue Shark C-1977 X X X Great White Shark C-1977 X X X Basking Shark C-1977 X X X Great White Shark C-1977 X X X Masking Shark C-1977 X X X Salmon Shark C-1977 X X X Opah C-1976 X X X Louvar C-1984 X X X Dolphin R-1973 R-1983 R-1983 Y		Skipjack Tuna	C-1916	C-1975	C-1975		X	X
Surpea MartinR-1947C-1950SXXXShortfin Mako SharkC-1977XXThresher SharksC-1977XXBlue SharkC-1977XXGreat White SharkC-1979XBasking SharkC-1991XSalmon SharkC-1976XOpahC-1976XLouvarC-1984DolphinR-1983R-1983DolphinR-1973R-1983		Yellowfin Tuna Stuin od Mauilin	C-1916 B 1047	C-1975	C-1975	X	X	X
Thresher SharksC-1977XXThresher SharksC-1977XXBlue SharkC-1977XXGreat White SharkC-1979XBasking SharkC-1991XSalmon SharkC-1977XOpahC-1976XLouvarC-1984Y		Stripea Marilin Shortfin Mako Shark	K-1947 C-1977	C-1950s	X X		Λ	A X
Blue SharkC-1977XXGreat White SharkC-1979XBasking SharkC-1991XSalmon SharkC-1977XOpahC-1976XLouvarC-1984DolphinR-1973R-1983PolphinR-1973R-1983		Thresher Sharks	C - 1977		X			X
Great White Shark C-1979 X Basking Shark C-1991 X Salmon Shark C-1977 X Opah C-1976 X Louvar C-1984 Y		Blue Shark	C-1977				X	X
Basking Shark C-1991 X Salmon Shark C-1977 X Opah C-1976 X Louvar C-1984 Y		Great White Shark	C-1979					X
Salmon Shark C-1977 X Opah C-1976 X Louvar C-1984 X Dolphin R-1973 R-1983		Basking Shark	C-1991					X
Opah C-1976 Louvar C-1984 Dolphin R-1973 R-1983 R-1983 Y		Salmon Shark	C-1977					X
Louvar C-1984 Dolphin R-1973 R-1983 R-1083 Y		Opah	C-1976					
		Louvar Dolphin	C-1984 R-1973	R-1983	R-1983			X

Precautionary Approach (FAO 1995)

Pre-1990s: Maximum Sustained Yield (MSY)

Post-1990s: Reference Points

Target Reference Point:

A goal such as MSY, OSY, MS Profit

Limit Reference Point:

A state to be avoided, e.g. low biomass

How do we determine this?

If breeched, take drastic, pre-agreed action

PopulationSustainability

Age structured population with density-dependent recruitment

$$R_t = B_t \qquad f[C_t]$$

Recruitment = Egg production x Survival [density]

Where
$$B_t = \Sigma b_a n_{a,t}$$
 and $C_t = \Sigma c_a n_{a,t}$

Questions: Equilibrium? Collapse?

Answer: Graphical interpretation: Sissenwine and Shepherd 1987 Question: what is the population equilibrium, and when does it go to zero, i.e., when does the population collapse?



Total egg production per year

Recruit = fish entering population at young age

Sustainability of Populations: how hard can we fish?



age

Recruitment

Note: Population collapses
when1/LEP=slope-at -the-origin
of egg/recruit relationship (or
LEP<1/slope-at-low-abundance)
Highly uncertain. Why?



Theory: random age structured populations, no densitydependence (Tuljapurkar refs, Lande and Orzack (1988))

Probability of N dropping below certain level N_E from $In[N_T/N_0]$ =Gaussian[mT, σ^2 T]

OR:
$$N_T \sim N_0 e^{\mu T}$$

To keep prob[collapse] low, we should keep N_0 and growth rate from becoming too low.

In practical terms, we therefore track N gr B and LEP

Current abundance, biomass

Current growth, replacement rate

How much LEP is enough? 1. We express this as a fraction of natural, unfished LEP (i.e., FLEP).

 From examples where we have data: 35% (Clark 1991) 30% (Mace and Sissenwine 1993) 40% (Clark 1993, Mace 1994) 55-60% (Dorn 2002, for rockfishes)

FLEP a.k.a. Spawning Potential Ratio

How much N or B is enough?

Again choose value relative to unfished value, e.g., .4 or .5 times N_0 or B_0

Summary:

To avoid collapse, track and set limits on

1. Abundance or biomass AND 2.replacement rate

Similar to NMFS:

Control rules track

- 1. Spawning biomass (overfished)
- 2. Fishing mortality rate F (overfishing)

Set to MSY levels, B_{MSY} , F_{MSY}

In data moderate case (US west coast),

 $\rm F_{35\%}$ used as proxy for $\rm F_{MSY}$

California (also similar):

"Resources are continuously replaced, taking into account fluctuations in abundance and environmental variability" (Fish & Game Code 99.5(a))

Follows federal example (Restrepo, et al. 1998)

See California's Marine Life Management Act (1999) and Phipps, et al. (2009) this workshop

Data types in all 149 species



Question: Do the fisheries w/o assessments have sufficient data to estimate depletion of replacement?

Of the 149 fished species in California,

46 (31 percent) have stock assessments

8 have a data-poor assessment of FLEP, reduction in replacement (from size distributions)

No data-poor assessments of depletion in abundance (e.g., from CPUE)

Data Poor Estimation: Size Distribution Of catch



Blue rockfish



FLEP estimated for several California

Blue rockfish	32%	Concern	
Black rockfish	13%	Concern	
Brown rockfish	>100%		
China Rockfish*	47%		
Copper rockfish	22%	Concern	
Kelp rockfish*	>100%		
Olive rockfish	20%	Concern	
Sanddab*	100%		



Conclusions:

California has stock assessments for 46 of 149 species (almost a third)

Based on data presence/absence, it has the potential for assessing depletion or reduction in replacement for about another third.

We recommend they pursue these "partial, data-poor assessments " in addition to additional data gathering and stock assessments.

THANKS



Marine Ecosystem Management

At UCDavis, the Ag school

Fisheries Management

Initially, we don't know the egg/recruit relationship. Specify seasons, number of boats, size limits, etc.

As fishing increases, LEP, equilibrium decline.



Egg production

There is uncertainty in:

- 1. Current recruitment, egg production, i.e., effects of management
- 2. Where population collapses (i.e., slope-at-origin)

LEP, a measure of Replacement (Here same as EPR)

Sustainability requires that individuals in a population replace themselves in their lifetime.



In humans, a couple replaces themselves with 2 babies



We can observe eggs. How many eggs does it take to replace one fish? 1/(slope of egg-recruit curve at low levels)

Similar to NMFS, but different rationale

Track B and F to determine Overfishing and Overfished



time

Try to keep biomass from sinking too low by taking action when estimated biomass and growth rates are low.

Results: data grouped as in Leet, et al. (2003)

Category	Total Number Species/Groups	Landings	Effort	Size Composition	Age Composition	Stock Assessed	Life History	No Fishery Data
Nearshore Invertebrates	19	18	8	5	0	0	16	1
Nearshore Finfish	68	65	46	47	10	13	54	3
Coastal Pelagic Species	5	5	3	1	3	2	5	0
Highly Migratory Species	15	15	7	9	3	7	13	0
Groundfish	19	19	16	19	12	19	18	0
Salmon	4	4	3	4	3	3	4	0
Estuarine Invertebrates	6	1	2	0	0	0	6	4
Estuarine Finfish	13	8	4	5	1	2	12	5
Total	149	135	89	90	32	46	128	13